## Scalable Auction Algorithms for Bipartite Maximum Matching Problems

Quanquan C. Liu

Joint work with


Yiduo Ke


Samir Khuller

## Bipartite Matching Problems

- Maximum Matching: return matching of maximum size



## Bipartite Matching Problems

- Maximum Matching: return matching of maximum size



## Bipartite Matching Problems

- Maximum Weighted Matching: return matching of maximum weight



## Bipartite Matching Problems

- Maximum Weighted Matching: return matching of maximum weight



## Bipartite Matching Problems

- Maximum b-Matching: return matching of maximum size when each node $v$ can be matched to at most $b_{v}$ nodes



## Bipartite Matching Problems

- Maximum b-Matching: return matching of maximum size when each node $v$ can be matched to at most $b_{v}$ nodes



## Approximate Bipartite Matching Problems

- Let $M^{*}$ be the optimum matching solution
- A $(1-\varepsilon)$-approximate solution $\widehat{M}$ has value at least:

$$
\widehat{M} \geq(1-\varepsilon) \cdot M^{*}
$$

## Auction-Based Maximum Matching

- Introduced by Demange, Gale, and Sotomayor '86 and Bertsekas '81 for exact (weighted) matching
- Same runtime as Hungarian method and maxflow


## Auction-Based Maximum Matching

- Introduced by Demange, Gale, and Sotomayor '86 and Bertsekas '81 for exact (weighted) matching
- Same runtime as Hungarian method and maxflow
- Dobzinski, Nisan, and Oren '14 extend to approximation and blackboard distributed setting


## Auction-Based Maximum Matching

- Introduced by Demange, Gale, and Sotomayor '86 and Bertsekas '81 for exact (weighted) matching
- Same runtime as Hungarian method and maxflow
- Dobzinski, Nisan, and Oren '14 extend to approximation and blackboard distributed setting
- $(1-\varepsilon)$-approximation in $O\left(\frac{\log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ rounds


## Auction-Based Maximum Matching

- Introduced by Demange, Gale, and Sotomayor '86 and Bertsekas '81 for exact (weighted) matching
- Same runtime as Hungarian method and maxflow
- Dobzinski, Nisan, and Oren '14 extend to approximation and blackboard distributed setting
- $(1-\varepsilon)$-approximation in $O\left(\frac{\log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ rounds
- Assadi, Liu, and Tarjan '21 extend to semi-streaming and MPC


## Auction-Based Maximum Matching

- Introduced by Demange, Gale, and Sotomayor '86 and Bertsekas '81 for exact (weighted) matching
- Same runtime as Hungarian method and maxflow
- Dobzinski, Nisan, and Oren '14 extend to approximation and blackboard distributed setting
- $(1-\varepsilon)$-approximation in $O\left(\frac{\log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ rounds
- Assadi, Liu, and Tarjan ' 21 extend to semi-streaming and MPC
- $O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ passes in streaming, $O\left(n \log \left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right)\right)$ space
- $O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}} \cdot \log \log n\right)$-round, $\boldsymbol{O}(n)$-memory algorithm in MPC


## Auction-Based Maximum

Zheng and Henzinger '23 extends MWM to sequential and dynamic models

- Introduced by Demange, Gale, and Sotomayor '86 and Bertsekas '81 for exact (weighted) matching
- Same runtime as Hungarian method and maxflow
- Dobzinski, Nisan, and Oren '14 extend to approximation and blackboard distributed setting
- $(1-\varepsilon)$-approximation in $O\left(\frac{\log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ rounds
- Assadi, Liu, and Tarjan ' 21 extend to semi-streaming and MPC
- $O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ passes in streaming, $O\left(n \log \left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right)\right)$ space
- $O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}} \cdot \log \log n\right)$-round, $\boldsymbol{O}(n)$-memory algorithm in MPC


## Our Results

MWM = Maximum Weighted Matching MCBM = Maximum Cardinality b-Matching

|  | Model |  | Previous Results |  | Our Results |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Blackboard Distributed | MWM | $\Omega(n \log n)($ trivial $)$ | [DNO14] | $O\left(\frac{n \log ^{3}(n)}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right)$ | Theorem 3.9 |
|  |  | MCBM | $\Omega(n b \log n)$ | trivial | $O\left(\frac{n b \log ^{2} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ | Theorem 4.8 |
| "Universal" solution across many different scalable models! | Streaming | MWM | $O\left(\frac{\log (1 / \varepsilon)}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ pass $O\left(\frac{n \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ space | [AG11] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O(n \cdot \log n \cdot \log (1 / \varepsilon)) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.11 |
|  |  | MCbM | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\log n / \varepsilon^{3}\right) \text { pass } \\ \widetilde{O}\left(\frac{\sum_{i \in L \cup R} b_{i}}{\varepsilon^{3}}\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | [AG18] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O\left(\left(\sum_{i \in L} b_{i}+\|R\|\right) \log (1 / \varepsilon)\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 4.10 |
|  | MPC | MWM | $\begin{gathered} O_{\varepsilon}(\log \log n) \text { rounds } \\ O_{\varepsilon}(n \operatorname{poly}(\log n)) \\ \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | [GKMS19] <br> (general) | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{\log \log n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { rounds } \\ O\left(n \cdot \log _{(1 / \varepsilon)}(n)\right) \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.15 |
|  | Parallel | MWM | $\begin{gathered} \hline \hline O(m \cdot \operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \text { work*}^{*} \\ O(\operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \operatorname{depth}^{*} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} {[\mathrm{HS} 22]} \\ \text { (general) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{m \log (n)}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { work } \\ & O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { depth } \end{aligned}$ | Theorem 3.13 |
|  |  | MCBM | N/A | N/A | $O\left(\frac{m \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ work <br> $O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ depth | Theorem 4.11 |

## Our Results

MWM = Maximum Weighted Matching MCBM = Maximum Cardinality b-Matching

| First results in blackboard distributed | Model |  | Previous Results |  | Our Results |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Blackboard Distributed | MWM | $\Omega(n \log n)$ (trivial) | [DNO14] | $O\left(\frac{n \log ^{3}(n)}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right)$ | Theorem 3.9 |
|  |  | MCbM | $\Omega(n b \log n)$ | trivial | $O\left(\frac{n b \log ^{2} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ | Theorem 4.8 |
|  | Streaming | MWM | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{\log (1 / \varepsilon)}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { pass } \\ & O\left(\frac{n \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { space } \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | [AG11] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O(n \cdot \log n \cdot \log (1 / \varepsilon)) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.11 |
|  |  | МСвм |  | [AG18] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O\left(\left(\sum_{i \in L} b_{i}+\|R\|\right) \log (1 / \varepsilon)\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 4.10 |
|  | MPC | MWM | $\begin{gathered} \hline O_{\varepsilon}(\log \log n) \text { rounds } \\ O_{\varepsilon}(n \text { poly }(\log n)) \\ \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | [GKMS19] (general) | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{\log \log n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { rounds } \\ O\left(n \cdot \log _{(1 / \varepsilon)}(n)\right) \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.15 |
|  | Parallel | MWM | $\begin{gathered} \hline O(m \cdot \operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \text { work* } \\ O(\text { poly }(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \operatorname{depth} * \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} {[\mathrm{HS} 22]} \\ \text { (general) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{m \log (n)}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { work } \\ & O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{n}}\right) \text { depth } \end{aligned}$ | Theorem 3.13 |
|  |  | MСвМ | N/A | N/A | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{m \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { work } \\ & O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { depth } \end{aligned}$ | Theorem 4.11 |

## Our Results

MWM = Maximum Weighted Matching MCBM = Maximum Cardinality b-Matching

|  | Model |  | Previous Results |  | Our Results |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Blackboard <br> Distributed | MWM | $\Omega(n \log n)($ trivial $)$ | [DNO14] | $O\left(\frac{n \log ^{3}(n)}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right)$ | Theorem 3.9 |
|  |  | MCbM | $\Omega(n b \log n)$ | trivial | $O\left(\frac{n b \log ^{2} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ | Theorem 4.8 |
| Eliminate polynomial dependence in $\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right)$ in space | Streaming | MWM | $O\left(\frac{\log (1 / \varepsilon)}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ pass <br> $O\left(\frac{n \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ space | [AG11] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O(n \cdot \log n \cdot \log (1 / \varepsilon)) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.11 |
|  |  | MCBM | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\log n / \varepsilon^{3}\right) \text { pass } \\ \widetilde{O}\left(\frac{\sum_{i \in L \cup R} b_{i}}{\varepsilon^{3}}\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | [AG18] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O\left(\left(\sum_{i \in L} b_{i}+\|R\|\right) \log (1 / \varepsilon)\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 4.10 |
|  | MPC | MWM | $\begin{aligned} & \hline O_{\varepsilon}(\log \log n) \text { rounds } \\ & O_{\varepsilon}(n \operatorname{poly}(\log n)) \\ & \text { space p.m. } \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} {[\text { GKMS19] }} \\ \text { (general) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{\log \log n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { rounds } \\ O\left(n \cdot \log _{(1 / \varepsilon)}(n)\right) \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.15 |
|  | Parallel | MWM | $\begin{gathered} \hline \hline O(m \cdot \operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \text { work }^{*} \\ O(\operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \text { depth* }^{*} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} {[\mathrm{HS} 22]} \\ \text { (general) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{m \log (n)}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { work } \\ & O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { depth } \end{aligned}$ | Theorem 3.13 |
|  |  | MCbM | N/A | N/A | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{m \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { work } \\ & O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { depth } \end{aligned}$ | Theorem 4.11 |

## Our Results

MWM = Maximum Weighted Matching MCBM = Maximum Cardinality b-Matching

|  | Model |  | Previous Results |  | Our Results |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Blackboard Distributed | MWM | $\Omega(n \log n)($ trivial $)$ | [DNO14] | $O\left(\frac{n \log ^{3}(n)}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right)$ | Theorem 3.9 |
|  |  | MCbM | $\Omega(n b \log n)$ | trivial | $O\left(\frac{n b \log ^{2} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ | Theorem 4.8 |
|  | Streaming | MWM | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{\log (1 / \varepsilon)}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { pass } \\ & O\left(\frac{n \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { space } \end{aligned}$ | [AG11] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O(n \cdot \log n \cdot \log (1 / \varepsilon)) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.11 |
|  |  | MCbM | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\log n / \varepsilon^{3}\right) \text { pass } \\ \widetilde{O}\left(\frac{\sum_{i \in L U B} b_{i}}{\varepsilon^{3}}\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | [AG18] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O\left(\left(\sum_{i \in L} b_{i}+\|R\|\right) \log (1 / \varepsilon)\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 4.10 |
| Eliminate exponential dependence on $\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right)$ | MPC | MWM | $\begin{aligned} & O_{\varepsilon}(\log \log n) \text { rounds } \\ & O_{\varepsilon}(n \text { poly }(\log n)) \\ & \text { space p.m. } \end{aligned}$ | [GKMS19] (general) | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{\log \log n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { rounds } \\ O\left(n \cdot \log _{(1 / \varepsilon)}(n)\right) \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.15 |
|  | Parallel | MWM | $\begin{gathered} \hline \hline O(m \cdot \operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \text { work}^{*} \\ O(\operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \text { depth* }^{*} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} {[\mathrm{HS} 22]} \\ \text { (general) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{m \log (n)}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { work } \\ O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { depth } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.13 |
|  |  | MCbM | N/A | N/A | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{m \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { work } \\ & O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { depth } \end{aligned}$ | Theorem 4.11 |

## Our Results

MWM = Maximum Weighted Matching MCBM = Maximum Cardinality b-Matching


## Outline

- Auction Algorithm of [ALT21] for maximum cardinality matching
- Our auction algorithm for maximum weighted matching
- Algorithm description
- Minimizing dependence on $\log (W)$
- Our auction algorithm for maximum $b$-matching


## Outline

- Auction Algorithm of [ALT21] for maximum cardinality matching
- Our auction algorithm for maximum weighted matching
- Algorithm description
- Minimizing dependence on log (W)
- Our auction algorithm for maximum b-matching


## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Left and Right Side of Bipartite Graph


## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Left and Right Side of Bipartite Graph


# Left Side has Bidders and Right Side has Items 

Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]


## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iteratively, bidders bid on all lowest price adjacent items


All items start with price 0

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iteratively, bidders bid on all lowest price adjacent items


All items start with price 0

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iteratively, bidders bid on all lowest price adjacent items


0
0 Find maximal matching among induced subgraph of bid items

0

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Increase price of items in matching by $\varepsilon$ and maintain current matching


## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Increase price of items in matching by $\varepsilon$ and maintain current matching

$\varepsilon$
0
0

0


Can bid on item as long as price < 1

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iterate for<br>$\left\lceil\frac{2}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right\rceil$ iterations



Can bid on item as long as price < 1

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iterate for<br>$\left\lceil\frac{2}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right\rceil$ iterations



Can bid on item as long as price < 1

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iterate for
$\left\lceil\frac{2}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right\rceil$ iterations
Each unmatched bidder bids

$\mathcal{E}$
0
0

0
R

Can bid on item as long as price < 1

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iterate for

| Each unmatched |
| :---: |
| bidder bids |

$L$

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iterate for
$\left\lceil\frac{2}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right\rceil$ iterations
Item goes to new bidder!


Can bid on item as long as price < 1


## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iterate for<br>$\left\lceil\frac{2}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right\rceil$ iterations



Can bid on item as long as price < 1

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Iterate for<br>$\left\lceil\frac{2}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right\rceil$ iterations



Can bid on item as long as price < 1

## Auction Algorithm of [ALT21]

Final Matching


## Outline

- Auction Algorithm of [ALT21] for maximum cardinality matching
- Our auction algorithm for maximum weighted matching
- Algorithm description
- Minimizing dependence on $\log (W)$
- Our auction algorithm for maximum b-matching


## Our Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

- Bucket the edges using buckets based on the weights of the edges
- Rescale weights to $(0,1]$
- Edge with weight $w \in(0,1]$ is in bucket $b$ if

$$
\varepsilon^{b-1} \leq w<\varepsilon^{b-2}
$$

## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

Increase price of items in matching by $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon} \cdot \boldsymbol{w}$ and maintain current matching


## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

Increase price of items in matching by $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon} \cdot \boldsymbol{w}$ and maintain current matching


## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

Increase price of items in matching by $\boldsymbol{\varepsilon} \cdot \boldsymbol{w}$ and maintain current matching


## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

Iterate for<br>$\left\lceil\frac{\log ^{2}(n)}{\varepsilon^{4}}\right\rceil$ iterations



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

| Iterate for |
| :---: |
| $\left\lceil\frac{\log ^{2}(n)}{\varepsilon^{4}}\right\rceil$ iterations |
| Each unmatched <br> bidder bids |


|  | 0.7ع |
| :---: | :---: |
|  | 0 |
|  | 0 |
|  | 0.35ع |
|  | 0 |
| L |  |

## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

> Iterate for
> $\left\lceil\frac{\log ^{2}(n)}{\varepsilon^{4}}\right\rceil$ iterations

Item goes to new bidder!


## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

Iterate for<br>$\left\lceil\frac{\log ^{2}(n)}{\varepsilon^{4}}\right\rceil$ iterations



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

Iterate for<br>$\left\lceil\frac{\log ^{2}(n)}{\varepsilon^{4}}\right\rceil$ iterations



## Our Simplified Maximum Weight Auction Algorithm

Final Matching


## Minimizing Dependence on $\log (W)$

- Modified Gupta-Peng '13 transformation
- Partition edges into levels based on edge weight
- Each level contains multiple buckets
- Omit certain buckets to prevent too large ratio in weights
- Ratio of weights in each level is bounded by $\varepsilon^{-o\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right)}$


## Minimizing Dependence on $\log (W)$

- Modified Gupta-Peng '13 transformation
- Partition edges into levels based on edge weight
- Each level contains multiple buckets
- Omit certain buckets to prevent too large ratio in weights
- Ratio of weights in each level is bounded by $\varepsilon^{-o\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon}\right)}$


## Iterate for <br> $\left\lceil\frac{\log ^{2}(n)}{\varepsilon^{4}}\right\rceil$ iterations



Iterate for
$\left\lceil\frac{\log (n)}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right\rceil$ iterations

## Outline

- Auction Algorithm of [ALT21] for maximum cardinality matching
- Our auction algorithm for maximum weighted matching
- Algorithm description
- Minimizing dependence on log (W)
- Our auction algorithm for maximum $b$-matching


## Very brief!

## Very Simplified Maximum b-Matching Algorithm

Create a copy for each bidder and item equal to their $b$ value


## Very Simplified Maximum $b$-Matching Algorithm

## Create a biclique

 between copies representing bidder and item

## Very Simplified Maximum $b$-Matching Algorithm

Create a biclique between copies representing bidder and item


Make sure match only one copy!

## Very Simplified Maximum $b$-Matching Algorithm

Create a biclique between copies representing bidder and item


Make sure match only one copy!

Solution: each time price increases, increase the lowest possible bidding price for each unmatched bidder

## Our Results

MWM = Maximum Weighted Matching MCBM = Maximum Cardinality b-Matching

|  | Model |  | Previous Results |  | Our Results |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Blackboard Distributed | MWM | $\Omega(n \log n)($ trivial $)$ | [DNO14] | $O\left(\frac{n \log ^{3}(n)}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right)$ | Theorem 3.9 |
|  |  | MCBM | $\Omega(n b \log n)$ | trivial | $O\left(\frac{n b \log ^{2} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ | Theorem 4.8 |
| "Universal" solution across many different scalable models! | Streaming | MWM | $O\left(\frac{\log (1 / \varepsilon)}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ pass $O\left(\frac{n \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ space | [AG11] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{8}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O(n \cdot \log n \cdot \log (1 / \varepsilon)) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.11 |
|  |  | MCbM | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\log n / \varepsilon^{3}\right) \text { pass } \\ \widetilde{O}\left(\frac{\sum_{i \in L \cup R} b_{i}}{\varepsilon^{3}}\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | [AG18] | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{1}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right) \text { pass } \\ O\left(\left(\sum_{i \in L} b_{i}+\|R\|\right) \log (1 / \varepsilon)\right) \text { space } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 4.10 |
|  | MPC | MWM | $\begin{gathered} O_{\varepsilon}(\log \log n) \text { rounds } \\ O_{\varepsilon}(n \operatorname{poly}(\log n)) \\ \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | [GKMS19] <br> (general) | $\begin{gathered} O\left(\frac{\log \log n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { rounds } \\ O\left(n \cdot \log _{(1 / \varepsilon)}(n)\right) \text { space p.m. } \end{gathered}$ | Theorem 3.15 |
|  | Parallel | MWM | $\begin{gathered} \hline \hline O(m \cdot \operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \text { work*}^{*} \\ O(\operatorname{poly}(1 / \varepsilon, \log n)) \\ \operatorname{depth}^{*} \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{gathered} {[\mathrm{HS} 22]} \\ \text { (general) } \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & O\left(\frac{m \log (n)}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { work } \\ & O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{7}}\right) \text { depth } \end{aligned}$ | Theorem 3.13 |
|  |  | MCBM | N/A | N/A | $O\left(\frac{m \log n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ work <br> $O\left(\frac{\log ^{3} n}{\varepsilon^{2}}\right)$ depth | Theorem 4.11 |

